

**MINUTES OF THE
WV CONSOLIDATED PUBLIC RETIREMENT BOARD
MEETING OF JANUARY 13, 2010**

A meeting of the West Virginia Consolidated Public Retirement Board of Trustees was held at the Board Conference Room, 4101 MacCorkle Avenue, SE, Charleston, West Virginia 25304 and was called to order at 10:00 a.m. by Chairman David Wyant.

Roll Call was taken and trustees present were:

David Wyant, Esquire, Chairman
Meredith George, Esquire, *representing Governor Joe Manchin, III*
Mack Parsons, *representing Auditor Glen Gainer*
Diana Stout, Esquire *representing Treasurer John Perdue*
Donna Lipscomb, *representing Secretary Robert Ferguson, Jr.*
F/LT Michael Corsaro
E. Gene Davis
Charles D. Lanham
Joe Lynch
D. Todd Murray
Andrew Richardson, Esquire

Trustees not present:

David Fletcher
Drema Evans

A quorum was present. Due notice had been posted.

Also in attendance were:

Anne Werum Lambright, Esquire, Executive Director, CPRB
Terasa L. Miller, Chief Operating Officer, CPRB
Anita Brewster, Executive Assistant, CPRB
Brittany Smith, Office Assistant, CPRB
Cindy Adkins, Office Manager, CPRB
Lenna Chambers, Esquire, Bowles Rice McDavid Graff and Love
Jeaneen Legato, Esquire, In House Legal Counsel
Jack DeBolt, Esquire, Hearing Officer
Anne Charnock, Esquire, Hearing Officer
Barbara Haddad, CPRB Chief IT/Information Officer
Jeffrey Fleck, CPRB Compliance Officer
Harry Mandel, CPRB Board Actuary
Melody Bailey, CPRB Actuary Assistant
Lisa Trump, CPRB PERS Manager
Deana Gose, CPRB Uniformed Services Manager
Mark Miller, CPRB Chief Financial Officer
Tom Sauvageot, WVIMB
Kris Morton, Great West Regional Manager
Andrew Wyne, Great West Outreach Officer
David Driscoll, FSA, EA, MAAA, Buck Consultants

Tab #1: Approval of the December 9, 2009, Meeting Minutes

Mr. Lanham moved to approve the December 9, 2009, minutes of the Consolidated Public Retirement Board and the motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. The motion carried unanimously. The minutes are behind Tab #1.

Tab# 2: Reports of the Chairman and Executive Director

The Board heard the report from Executive Director Lambright which included the following information:

1. Budget figures for December 2009:

Director Lambright reviewed with the Board the budget figures for December 2009;

2. VALIC lawsuit:

Director Lambright informed the Board that a copy of the Answer filed in the IMB/CPRB declaratory action against VALIC was in their book;

3. Computer System Update Committee:

Director Lambright informed the Board that the Computer System Update Committee had met via telephone on January 6th for a status update and that Staff and Board member David Fletcher would be traveling to Raleigh, North Carolina on January 21, 2010 for a site visit and would be traveling via the State airplane;

4. Ethics Commission Conflict form:

Director Lambright reminded Board members that they needed to complete and return the yellow Ethics Commission Conflict form they had received in the mail;

5. Notes, Quotes and Antidotes:

Director Lambright informed the Board that CPRB Office Assistant Brittany Smith had been chosen the Department of Administration's Employee of the Month for January and that Theresa Kline, PERS Retirement Advisor, had been chosen the Department of Administration's Employee of the Month for February;

6. 2010 Agency Goals:

Director Lambright informed the Board a copy of the 2010 Agency Goals was in their book;

7. Reality Investing and Outreach Seminars:

Director Lambright informed the Board a copy of the Reality Investing and TDC

Outreach Seminar updates was in their Board books;

8. Debt Reduction Information;

Director Lambright informed the Board that CPRB had not received an update on the debt reduction monies being deposited by the State Budget office into TRS;

9. State Police Plan A & B Disability Retirement Experience:

Director Lambright informed the Board copies of the WV State Police Retirement System Plan A and Plan B disability retirement experience was in their book;

10. TDC TPA RFP:

Director Lambright informed the Board a draft of the TDC RFP was on the Board's secured web site for their review and the deadline for comments was February 3, 2010.

The Director's full report is behind Tab #2.

Tab #3: Plans Investment Data

Tom Sauvegeot, of the West Virginia Investment Management Board, reviewed with the Board the WVIMB data for the period through November 30, 2009. Discussion followed.

Tab #4: Consideration of Current Disability Retirement Applications

E. Gene Davis, Chair of the Disability Review Committee, reviewed the disability report with the Board. He stated that the Committee met prior to this Board meeting and offered the following recommendations:

System	Yes	No	Total
PERS	15	3	18
TDC	2	0	2
TDC/TRS	3	0	3
TRS	3	1	4
TOTAL	23	4	27

Mr. Lynch moved that the Board accept the Disability Committee's recommendations concerning the retirement disability applications. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. The motion carried. The disability list is behind Tab #4.

Mr. Davis informed the Board that the Disability Committee was recommending the Board

allow the CPRB staff to omit the step of a CPRB physician examination of a disability applicant who: 1) has been diagnosed with Stage 4 cancer; 2) is receiving or has received chemotherapy treatments, and 3) has two treating oncologists who will certify that the disability applicant meets the plan's disability standards. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Wyant informed the Board that at this time he was going to change the agenda and move to Tab # 8: Valuations-Buck Consultants, David Driscoll.

Tab #8: Actuarial Valuations-Buck Consultants, David Driscoll

David Driscoll, FSA, EA, MAAA, reviewed with the Board the Actuarial Valuations for PERS, TRS, Plan A, Plan B and JRS as of July 1, 2009. Discussion followed. Mr. Richardson moved that the Board accept and adopt the Actuarial Valuations of West Virginia Retirement Plans as prepared and presented by Buck Consultants. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lipscomb. The motion carried unanimously.

Tab #9: PERS and State Police Plan B Contribution Rates-Harry Mandel

Harry Mandel, Board Actuary, reviewed with the Board his recommendation regarding the Public Employee Retirement System (PERS) employer contribution rate being increased from 11% to 17% effective July 1, 2010. Mr. Murray moved to accept the recommendation of the Board Actuary to increase the employer contribution rate for the Public Employee Retirement System from 11% to 17% effective July 1, 2010. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lanham. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Harry Mandel, Board Actuary, reviewed with the Board his recommendation regarding the State Police Plan B employer contribution rate being increased from 15% to 19.5% effective July 1, 2010. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Board Actuary to increase the employer contribution rate for State Police Plan B from 15% to 19.5% effective July 1, 2010. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lanham. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Tab #10: Actuarial Factors for Plan Administration-Harry Mandel

Harry Mandel, Board Actuary, reviewed with the Board his recommendation to approve the extension of the 2009 Actuarial Assumptions for daily administration to 2010 without modifications for the Teachers' Retirement System, the Public Employees Retirement System, the

State Police Plan A and Plan B, the Deputy Sheriff Retirement System, the Judges Retirement System and the Emergency Medical Services Retirement System. Mr. Richardson moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Board Actuary to extend the 2009 Actuarial Assumptions for daily administration to 2010 without modifications for the Teachers' Retirement System, the Public Employees Retirement System, the State Police Plan A and Plan B, the Deputy Sheriff Retirement System, the Judges Retirement System and the Emergency Medical Services Retirement System. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. The motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Wyant informed the Board that there were medical, legal and contractual matters which would need to be discussed in Executive Session.

Ms. Lipscomb made a motion that the Board go into Executive Session to discuss matters as allowed by West Virginia Code § 6-9A-4. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons and carried unanimously. The Board went into Executive Session at 11:05 a.m.

The Board reconvened the Public Session of the January 13, 2010, meeting of the Consolidated Public Retirement Board at 11:32 a.m.

Chairman Wyant announced that no decisions were made during the Executive Session.

Tab #5: Consideration of Appeals to Hearing Officers

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Thomas Bever. Mr. Richardson moved to accept the amended recommendation of the Hearing Officer and approve the appeal of Thomas Bever. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Richardson departed the meeting at 11:42 a.m.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Stewart Hill. Mr. Davis moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Stewart Hill. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. The motion carried with Ms. Stout voting in the negative.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Faiza Khan. Mr. Lanham moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Faiza Khan. The motion was seconded by Mr. Davis. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Judy Knopp. Mr. Davis moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Judy Knopp. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Alex Moore. Mr. Lynch moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Alex Moore. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Joyce Stump. Ms. Lipscomb moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and approve the appeal of Joyce Stump. The motion was seconded by Mr. Davis. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer DeBolt addressed the appeal of Patrick Woodyard. Ms. Stout moved that the Board accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Patrick Woodyard. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Ginger Blankenship. Mr. Lanham moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Ginger Blankenship. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Jacqueline Casto. Mr. Murray moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Jacqueline Casto. The motion was seconded by Mr. Davis. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Katrina Dennison. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Katrina Dennison. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Jacqueline Ellwanger. Mr. Lynch moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Jacqueline Ellwanger. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Gretchen Gill. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Gretchen Gill. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Nancy Harrison. Mr. Lanham moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Nancy Harrison. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Mary Harvey. F/LT Corsaro moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Mary Harvey. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Deborah Haun. Mr. Lanham moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Deborah Haun. The motion was seconded by Mr. Davis. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Vickie Hensley. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Vickie Hensley. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Karen Hollandsworth. F/LT Corsaro moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Karen Hollandsworth. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Ivan Houdersheldt. Mr. Lynch moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Ivan Houdersheldt. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Dennis Jarvis. F/LT Corsaro moved to

accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Dennis Jarvis. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. Discussion followed. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Amber King. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Amber King. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lanham. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Kara Koons. Mr. Lanham moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Kara Koons. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Jack McCullough. Mr. Lynch moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Jack McCullough. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Donna Morgan. F/LT Corsaro moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Donna Morgan. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Robert Morris. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Robert Morris. The motion was seconded by Mr. Murray. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Marsha Mounts. Mr. Lanham moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Marsha Mounts. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Cheryl Sells. Mr. Parsons moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Cheryl Sells. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Millicent Stoneking. Mr. Murray moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Millicent Stoneking. The motion was seconded by F/LT Corsaro. The motion carried unanimously.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Karen Vannater. F/LT Corsaro moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Karen Vannater. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lanham. The motion carried with Mr. Davis and Mr. Parsons voting in the negative.

Hearing Officer Charnock addressed the appeal of Vanessa Walker. Mr. Davis moved to accept the recommendation of the Hearing Officer and deny the appeal of Vanessa Walker. The motion was seconded by Mr. Parsons. The motion carried unanimously.

Tab #6: Work in Progress Reports from Legal Counsel

In-House Legal Counsel Jeaneen Legato gave a report to the Board concerning all pending legal matters. Discussion followed.

F/LT Corsaro moved that the Board instruct In-House Legal Counsel to proceed with the proper procedure to terminate the retirement account of Thomas Woodrum as a result of Less Than Honorable Service. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion carried unanimously.

Report of In House Legal Counsel is behind Tab #6.

Outside Legal Counsel Lenna Chambers gave a report to the Board concerning all pending legal matters. Discussion followed.

Report of Outside Legal Counsel is behind Tab #6.

Tab #7: Committee Updates

Ms. Stout, in the absence of Committee Chair Mr. Fletcher, informed the Board that the A & I Committee had met on January 6, 2010 and reviewed the draft TPA/RFP and that the deadline for comments to Ms. Stout from the Board Members and CPRB staff would be February 3, 2010. She further indicated that the draft RFP would be placed on the Board's secure website for the Board members to review and make comments.

Ms. George, in the absence of Committee Chair Mr. Deem, asked that Chief Information Officer Barbara Haddad report to the Board with regard to the Computer Systems Update Committee telephonic status meeting which was held on January 6, 2010. Ms. Haddad informed the Board that staff members were going to be going on a site visit to Raleigh, North Carolina on

January 21.

Director Lambright, in the absence of Committee Chair Secretary Ferguson, informed the Board that the Internal Audit Committee had held their monthly status telephone conference on Tuesday, January 12, 2010.

Ms. Stout departed the meeting at 12:45 p.m.

Tab #11: Old Business

Chairman Wyant asked for old business and none was heard.

Tab #12: Other, New Business

Chairman Wyant asked for new business.

F/LT Corsaro moved that the Board instruct the CPRB staff to prepare and present to the Legislature, without bringing back to the Board for approval, draft legislation regarding Trooper "Plan A" and Trooper "Plan B" to include the language as written in the Deputy Sheriff Retirement System 7-14D-26 regarding crime or fraud penalties and repayments. The motion was seconded by Mr. Lynch. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Wyant asked for new business and none was heard. Chairman Wyant adjourned the public meeting of the West Virginia Consolidated Public Retirement Board at 12:54 p.m.



David Wyant, Chairman
Consolidated Public Retirement Board



Anne Werum Lambright, Executive Director
Consolidated Public Retirement Board